

Horizons of Futures in Post-Utopian Mongolia

Eine Reihe des Instituts für Orient- und
Asienwissenschaften (IOA) der Universität
Bonn

Bonner Asienstudien

Editor

Stephan Conermann

(Dept. of Islamic Studies)

Volume 19

Editorial Board

Dagmar Glaß	(Dept. of Islamic Studies and Near Eastern Languages)
Manfred Hutter	(Dept. of Religious Studies)
Konrad Klaus	(Dept. of Indology)
Ralph Kauz	(Dept. of Chinese Studies)
Harald Meyer	(Dept. of Japanese and Korean Studies)
N.N.	(Dept. of Islamic Studies and Near Eastern Languages)
N.N.	(Dept. of Mongolian and Tibetan Studies)
Ines Stolpe	(Dept. of Mongolian and Tibetan Studies)
Reinhard Zöllner	(Dept. of Japanese and Korean Studies)
Julia Hegewald	(Dept. of Asian and Islamic Art History)

Ines Stolpe and Judith Nordby (Eds.)

Horizons of Futures in
Post-Utopian Mongolia

With the assistance of Sharleena Goerlitz



EBVERLAG

**Bibliographic information published
by Die Deutsche Bibliothek**

Die Deutsche Bibliothek lists this publication in the Deutsche Nationalbibliografie; detailed bibliographic data is available in the Internet at [<http://dnb.ddb.de>].

All rights reserved. No part of this book may be reproduced in any form or by any electronic or mechanical means, including information storage and retrieval systems, without written permission from the publisher or author, except in the case of a reviewer, who may quote brief passages embodied in critical articles or in a review.

– Gefördert vom DAAD aus Mitteln des Auswärtigen Amtes (AA) –

Cover picture: Mongolian traffic-light figures

Layout: Rainer Kuhl

Copyright ©: EB-Verlag Dr. Brandt
Berlin 2021

ISBN: 978-3-86893-370-3

Homepage: www.ebverlag.de

E-Mail: post@ebverlag.de

Printed and bound: Hubert & Co., Göttingen
Printed in Germany

Table of Contents

Acknowledgements.....	7
Note on Transliteration / Transcription.....	8
<i>Judith Nordby</i> Introduction.....	11
<i>Karénina Kollmar-Paulenz</i> Rewriting the Mongolian Past: “New” Master-Narratives, Scholarship and the State.....	25
<i>Ines Stolpe and Tümen-Očïryn Erdene-Očïr</i> <i>Nutag</i> Councils as Post-Socialist Resilience Cultures in Mongolia.....	49
<i>Saranzaya Manalsuren</i> Counting on Informal Networks: The Meaning, Influence and Role of the ‘ <i>Nutag</i> ’-Network in Mongolian Managers’ Thinking	115
<i>Paweł Szczap</i> Localizing Ideas of <i>Chot Nutag</i> by Mapping Ulaanbaatar Hip-Hop	139
<i>Chima Michael Anyadike-Danes</i> Rethinking Post-Socialism: Making Mongolia’s Future in Los Angeles	205
<i>Sayana Namsaraeva</i> Dystopian Mongolia: Reconceptualization of the Home Country by Mongolian Asylum Seekers in the UK.....	227
<i>Judith Nordby</i> <i>Translations on Mongolia: A Source on Mongolia’s</i> “Great Leap Forward”	251

<i>Oyuntuya Shagdarsuren</i> Notions of Sustainability in Mongolia's Education and Mining Sectors as Visions for Post-Socialist Futures.....	275
<i>Wolfram Schaffar</i> Comparing Post-Utopian Realities of Alternative Development in Mongolia and Latin America	311
<i>Temulen Chojjav</i> 'Beautiful Numbers': Mobile Phone Numbers as Status Symbols in Mongolia.....	345
<i>Ágnes Birtalan</i> From Traditional Rituals to Internet-Shamanism: Traces of the "Invented Tradition" in Contemporary Mongolian Shamanic Practice....	369
<i>Jigmeddorj Enkhbayar and Idermaa Garavsuren</i> Contemporary Funeral Rituals in Mongolia: Cases from Ulaanbaatar	399
<i>Agata Bareja-Starzyńska and Byambaa Ragchaagiin</i> Buddhist Responses to the Challenges of Transition in Mongolia: Old and New Methods	429
<i>Gabriel Bamana</i> Reversing to the Future: Traditions, Resistance, and Resilience in Post-Socialist Mongolia	457
Note on Contributors	481

Acknowledgements

First, we would especially like to thank all who took part in the *Second International Symposium of Mongolian Studies* “Horizons of Futures in Post-Utopian Mongolia”, organised and hosted by Mongolian Studies at Bonn University in 2017.¹ We not only thank those who have turned the talks they gave at the symposium into papers but also other scholars who have contributed their on-topic research findings for inclusion in this volume. Our particular thanks go to Sharleena Goerlitz, M.A. (PhD candidate in Mongolian Studies, Bonn University), whose great commitment, dedication and technical expertise substantially supported the realisation of this volume and to Tümen-Očiryn Erdene-Očir for his excellent help in the final proofreading.

The symposium could not have taken place without the generous financial support of the German Academic Exchange Service (Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst – DAAD), which has also sponsored the publication of this book. We express our sincere gratitude for their valuable contributions to the promotion of Mongolian Studies. Finally, we take this opportunity to thank Rainer Kuhl of *EB-Verlag Dr. Brandt Verlag für Wissenschaft und Praxis* for this excellent collaboration. It is our hope that this collection of papers will lead to further research and cooperation among scholars who are interested in Horizons of Futures in Post-Utopian Mongolia.

¹ Institute of Oriental and Asian Studies. The programme is available online: <https://www.ioa.uni-bonn.de/de/inst/mongtib/datei/flyer-2nd-symposium-2017>.

Note on Transliteration / Transcription

When transliterating from modern Cyrillic Mongolian, the authors represented in this volume follow the system devised by Hans-Peter Vietze (1988) as laid out in the table below.² For the classical Mongolian script, the internationally recognised transcription of Nicholas Poppe (1954) is used.³ Chinese words are Romanised using Pinyin. For words and references in Russian, alongside the scientific transliteration, a widely used pragmatic transcription, adjusted and without diacritics, is employed, as indicated in the table below. Wherever a Russian word is a standard term used in Mongolian (such as *njeft*), it is transliterated according to Vietze's system for Modern Mongolian. Systems for words in other languages or in Mongolian dialects are indicated by the individual authors who use them. Well-established spellings of toponyms, such as Gobi, ethnonyms, such as Buryat, or the personal names of authors, are exceptions to these rules.

For the name of the most famous Great Khan of the Mongols, there are many commonly used spellings in a variety of languages. Thus, we have decided to accept each author's choice of spelling according to what seemed most appropriate to them and likewise the spelling of *Kubilai Khan*. The form *Činggis Qan* is in accordance with Poppe's rules for transcribing the classical Mongolian script. Today, the Romanised spellings, *Chinggis* and *Chingis* are both widely used. By adopting the spelling *Khan* (*qan* according to Poppe's rule for transliterating this title) we have deliberately avoided the use of *chaan* (or *qayan* according to Poppe's rule), the general Mongolian term for 'Great Khan' or 'Emperor', since this was not, historically, used of *Činggis Qan* himself. It only came into use from the time of his immediate successor.

² Vietze, Hans-Peter (1988): Wörterbuch Mongolisch-Deutsch. Leipzig: Enzyklopädie.

³ Poppe, Nicholas (1954): Grammar of Written Mongolian. Wiesbaden: Harrassowitz (second printing: 1964). This system is sometimes called Vladimirtsov-Poppe-Mostaert.

Note on Contributors

Anyadike-Danes, Chima Michael, is currently a post-doctoral research associate at Durham University's Anthropology Department. He received his doctorate from the University of California, Irvine's Department of Anthropology in 2017. His dissertation, *Unwanted Becomings: Post-Socialist Mongolians in Settler-Colonial Los Angeles*, examined attitudes to extinction, practices of occupation, performances of identity, and imaginings of the future amongst a group of Mongolians, and their neighbours, dwelling in Los Angeles. Influenced by anthropology's phenomenological tradition he is interested in the role that Mongolian immigrants' lived experiences play in their creation of sociality, perpetuation of discourses, enablement of performances, and valuing of landscapes.

Bamana, Gabriel [Gaby], is an anthropologist and ethnologist. He completed a PhD entitled *From Birth to Death: Female Power and Gendered Meanings in Tea Practices in Mongolia: a Case Study in Ikh Uul County, Khovsgol Province* at the University of Wales Trinity Saint David in 2015. He is currently a visiting scholar at the Centre for East Asian Studies Groningen (CEASG), University of Groningen, in the Netherlands. His latest publications include *Tea Practice in Mongolia, Doing Ethnography beyond China*. His research interests are post-socialist Mongolia, Mongolian tea traditions, religions in Mongolia, and Afro-Asian relations.

Bareja-Starzyńska, Agata, Prof. Dr. Mongolist and Tibetologist, is Head of the Department of Turkish Studies and Inner Asian Peoples of the Faculty of Oriental Studies, University of Warsaw. Her scholarly interests focus on Buddhism in Mongolia and Tibet, Mongolian-Tibetan relations, and Mongolian and Tibetan literature. Her publications include a Polish translation of the *Čiqula kereglegči*, a 16th Century Mongolian Buddhist Treatise, articles on the revival of Buddhism in Mongolia after 1990, Mongolia related materials at W. Kotwicz's Archives in Cracow, a study and English translation of the Tibetan biography of Zanabazar, and papers on Zaya Gegeen and Lamyn Gegeen.

Birtalan, Ágnes, is Professor at Eötvös Loránd University (ELTE, Budapest) and Head of the Department of Mongolian and Inner Asian Studies. After

graduating in Mongolian Studies, World and Hungarian History, Russian Language and Literature at ELTE, she obtained her CSC doctorate in linguistics on the genres and language of Oirat folksongs and her habilitation on Mongolian folk religion. She has carried out fieldwork among various Mongolian groups in Mongolia, Russia and China. Her research interests are oral and written sources of Mongolian ethnic groups (especially on religion, folklore and dialects) and Korean religions. She has supervised many Hungarian and foreign PhD students.

Chojjav, Temulen, gained a degree in pharmacy at the Mongolian National University of Medical Sciences in 2011. He continued his studies in Germany at the University of Bonn under the guidance of Prof. Dr. Ines Stolpe, and completed a B.A in Asian Studies in 2018. He is currently working in the Mongolian pharmaceutical industry with particular responsibility for relations with the Asian market. He is also a keen observer of the social and political development of Mongolia.

Enkhbayar, Jigmeddorj, completed a PhD on 17th century Mongolian history at the National University of Mongolia in 2012. His research interests and areas of teaching include the history of Mongolia from the 17th to the beginning of the 20th century, political relations between Khalkha Mongolia and the Manchu Qing dynasty from 1635 to 1691, historical source materials in the Mongolian and Manchu languages, the *'Khalkha Mongolian Law Manuscript on the Birch Bark'* and its traditions and funeral rituals in Mongolia. He is currently Visiting Professor at Tokyo University of Foreign Studies (Japan).

Garavsuren, Idermaa, graduated with a bachelor's degree in Accounting and Economics from the Institute of Economics, Mongolian National University, in 1987. In 2003 she was awarded a master's degree in Business Administration at the National Academy of Governance of Mongolia before graduating from the ICCFA University in Virginia, USA, with a degree in Funeral Services Management in 2005. In 2008, she set up the Mongolian Funeral Association (MFA), an NGO which is a member of the International Cemetery, Cremation, and Funeral Association (ICCFA), Australian Cemeteries & Crematoria Association ACCA, National Funeral Directors Association /NFDA/, China Funeral Association /CFA/, the UK's National Funeral Directors Association and the Fu Shou Yuan International Group. She has served as president of MFA since its foundation. She is currently researching for a PhD in the Department of

History, National University of Mongolia, on the traditional and contemporary funeral rituals of Mongolia, the cemeteries in Ulaanbaatar City and the Mongolian cremation ritual.

Goerlitz, Sharleena, is a PhD student at the Department of Mongolian and Tibetan Studies of the University of Bonn. Her research focuses on social sustainability discourses in contemporary Mongolia. Alongside her studies, she worked as a research assistant at the German Development Institute, Bonn. She has been visiting Mongolia since 2015 and is especially interested in socio-ecological transformations as well as civil society engagement.

Kollmar-Paulenz, Karénina, is Professor of the Study of Religions and Central Asian Studies at the University of Bern. She completed a PhD in Tibetan Studies in 1991 at the University of Bonn. In 1999 she obtained her habilitation in Central Asian Studies at Bonn, with a study of the political and religious relations between Tibet and Mongolia in the sixteenth century. Her research interests and areas of teaching include the cultural history of Tibet and Mongolia, religion and politics in Inner Asia, Mongolian manuscript culture, Tibetan and Mongolian language, the global history of religion, and method and theory of religion.

Manalsuren, Saranzaya, is a Senior Lecturer in Management at London South Bank University. She completed her PhD on contemporary Mongolian management from the University of Essex in 2017. Her research focuses on cross-cultural management, human resource management and institutional changes in emerging countries, including Mongolia. She writes on the topics of managerial roles, symbols in an organisational context, and the relationship between culture and institutions in the case of Mongolia and other transitional economies. Currently, Saranzaya teaches at London South Bank University, as well as working as an independent consultant for cultural awareness in business negotiations and management of human resources for companies which operate in Mongolia, or are considering doing so in the future.

Namsaraeva, Sayana, is a Research Associate at the Mongolia & Inner Asia Studies Unit, University of Cambridge. After graduating in China Studies in Saint-Petersburg, she obtained her PhD degree from the Institute of Oriental Studies (Moscow, RAS) on the Qing Dynasty frontier administration in Inner Asia. Her research and teaching interests include historical anthropology of

Inner Asia, continental colonialism, and various aspects of transborder migration and trade between Russia, China and Mongolia.

Nordby, Judith, completed a PhD on 20th century Mongolian history in 1988 at the University of Leeds. She was head of Mongolian Studies at Leeds from 1988 to 2012. She provided reports on the politics and economy of contemporary Mongolia for the Economist Intelligence Unit for several years and was a regular participant in the Mongol-British Round Table. Since she retired in 2012 she has continued her research into contemporary Mongolian affairs and acts as a consultant on matters Mongolian.

Ragchaagiin, Byambaa, graduated from the Gandantegchenling monastery in Ulaanbaatar and the Institute of Buddhist Dialectics in Dharamsala, India. He has worked in the Mongolian Academy of Sciences and as the Head Librarian of the Gandantegchenling monastery. Since 2001 he has been lecturing on Mongolian in the Department of Turkish Studies and Inner Asian Peoples of the Faculty of Oriental Studies of the University of Warsaw. His scholarly interests focus on Buddhism in Mongolia. He authored *Zanabazaryn dörvölžin üseg*, established the series “Mongol Bilig” in which he has so far published 42 volumes documenting the Mongolian contribution to the Buddhist literature in the Tibetan language.

Schaffar, Wolfram, is currently Research Fellow at the International Institute for Asian Studies (IIAS) in Leiden, the Netherlands. Until May 2018, he served as Professor of Political Science and Development Studies at the University of Vienna. He has also taught at the Institute of Oriental and Asian Studies, University of Bonn; the Chulalongkorn University, Thailand; the Royal Netherlands Institute of Southeast Asian and Caribbean Studies (KITLV) in Leiden, the Netherlands. He served as a regular guest lecturer at Yangon University, Myanmar and the Jigme Shingye Wangchuk School of Law, Thimphu, Bhutan. In his research Schaffar focuses on democratisation and de-democratisation processes, state theory of the Global South and social movements, with a regional focus on Southeast Asia.

Shagdarsuren, Oyuntuya, is a PhD student at the Centre for Development Research and the Department of Mongolian and Tibetan Studies of the University of Bonn. Her current research focuses on the discursive construction of local concepts of sustainability in the mining and education sectors of

Mongolia. She obtained her MSc degree from the University of Reading, UK, on international and rural development and the use of information and communication technologies. She is also a development practitioner with work experience in agricultural, environmental, governance and mining sectors of Mongolia.

Stolpe, Ines, is Professor of Mongolian Studies at the University of Bonn. After graduating in Comparative Education and Mongolian Studies in Berlin and Ulaanbaatar, she obtained her PhD in Central Asian Studies from Humboldt University, Berlin, on the interdependencies of social and spatial mobility in contemporary Mongolia. Her research interests and areas of teaching include Mongolian language, cultural and political history and social change, politics of remembrance, civil society, educational philosophy, and post-socialist studies.

Szczap, Paweł, is a PhD candidate at the Faculty of Oriental Studies, University of Warsaw. He is currently preparing his dissertation in linguistics on place names in Ulaanbaatar. His research interests concentrate around the question of the urban in Mongolian culture and society and include the history and cartography of the Ulaanbaatar area, urban planning, address and administrative policies along with their impact on the urban population. He is part of the European Hip-hop Studies Network and teaches a course on Mongolian hip-hop at the University of Warsaw. While in Ulaanbaatar he regularly leads urban exploration walks around the city.

Tümen-Očiryn, Erdene-Očir, is currently Lecturer of Mongolian in the Department of Mongolian and Tibetan Studies at the University of Bonn. He is also a senior lecturer in Mongolian language and linguistics at the National University of Mongolia (NUM) on temporary leave. Erdene-Očir obtained his PhD in Linguistics from the National University of Mongolia in 2018 on the basis of his dissertation *A Comparative Study of the Metaphorical Expressions in English and Mongolian (as Examples of Proverbial Expressions within the Theoretical Frame of Cultural Linguistics)*. His research interests and areas of teaching include Mongolian language and culture, classical Mongolian script, teaching Mongolian as a foreign language, semantics, cultural linguistics, and cognitive linguistics.